

**TOWN OF PARADISE
TREE PERMIT REVIEW COMMITTEE
January 4, 2007 – 4:00 p.m.
Paradise Town Council Chambers
5555 Skyway, Paradise, CA**

MINUTES

CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Al McGreehan called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m.

ROLL CALL

Present at roll call were Tree Committee Members Timothy Negle, Denice Britton, L. Craig Woodhouse, Forrest Rea and Chairman Al McGreehan. Also present was Assistant Community Development Director Craig Baker.

1. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Regular meeting of November 8, 2006

It was moved by Committee Member Woodhouse, seconded by Committee Member Rea and unanimously carried by those present to approve the minutes of the regular meeting of November 8, 2006.

2. PUBLIC COMMUNICATION – None.

3. CONTINUED PUBLIC HEARING

- a. FEATHER RIVER HOSPITAL [TP-06-05-29] - Tree Felling Permit Application proposing the felling of ±276 qualifying trees on property located at 5974 Pentz Road, Paradise [AP No. 053-390-002, 003, 004, 005, 006, and 008]. The trees are proposed to be felled to accommodate the expansion and improvement of existing hospital facilities.**

Mr. Baker explained the proposed tree felling permit application. A proposed environmental document [mitigated negative declaration] was prepared and has resulted in several mitigation measures to address the impact of the removal of ±272 trees. California-registered professional forester Randolph Vasquez (RPF #1884), has certified that all 272 trees proposed for felling must be felled to accommodate the proposed project. Staff is recommending conditional approved of the tree felling application.

The agenda item was opened to the public. Appearing:

1. Steve Gonsalves, Nichols, Melburg and Rosetto, Applicant's Engineer/Architect. Mr. Gonsalves reviewed the tree removal plan for the Feather River Hospital expansion. He explained that 56% of

the tree replacement will be conifers. He requested some relief from the 2:1 replacement of the felled trees because there is not adequate room upon the project properties for the replacement trees, and it will be difficult to determine offsite locations for this large number of trees. He inquired whether the hospital could deposit monies into a fund for tree replacement for the town.

Mr. McGreehan responded that there is no program at this time to deposit funds with the Town for tree replacement.

2. Tom Gomez, Tom's Tree Service. Mr. Gomez discussed the disposition of the felled trees.

Committee Member Britton inquired whether the proposed road or helipad could be moved to preserve more trees.

3. Mr. Gonsalves responded that the Applicant believes they have made a good effort to preserve trees. The emergency helipad landing zone cannot be located on top of the leach field, and it needs to be in close proximity to the hospital. Root trimming will be done to preserve as many trees as possible.

4. Robin Huffman, Town Council Member. Ms. Huffman spoke in support of pervious asphalt. In addition she stated her opinion that the environmental document for the tree felling application should be reviewed and acted upon by the Planning Commission. She also stated that any decision made on this agenda item should be appealed to the Town Council due to the extent of the tree removal.

5. Mr. Gonsalves. Mr. Gonsalves stated that the leach field is designed to hide within the trees and was mandated by the California Regional Water Quality Control Board. The leach field will be covered with pine straw and eventually there will be other vegetation over the leach fields. Chippings will also be dispersed. The sewage treatment plant will be fenced but not the new leach fields. In response to an inquiry as to why tree replacement will not be 100% indigenous trees, Mr. Gonsalves stated that there will be decorative trees such as Dogwood, Magnolia, Red Bud, etc. to provide color and interest in the landscaping.

Chairman McGreehan explained that there is no land use decision to be made on this proposed project, therefore, the Tree Permit Review Committee is the only body that can review the environmental document. In addition, he advised Ms. Huffman that she may have to recuse herself from participating in any appeal of this agenda item to the Town Council due to her contribution to the hearing today.

The Committee discussed the use of pervious asphalt for the parking lot. The Town Engineer does not have experience with this type of asphalt and the cost could be prohibitive. The Committee discussed the existence of the large number of saplings on the property that could be considered for up to 50% of the replacement trees. Mr. Gonsalves stated that they will research the number of saplings on the property. Planting all the replacement trees on the property could cause a fire danger, and a 1:1 replacement ratio with 50% of such trees to be existing saplings could help alleviate this danger.

Chairman McGreehan stated that Pentz Road is a designated scenic route, and if there is an opportunity to retain trees, there is an obligation to preserve them. In addition, there should be trees to provide shade in the parking lots. The agenda item was closed to the public at this time.

After further discussion, it was moved by Chairman McGreehan, seconded by Forest Rea and carried to amend and adopt the findings as submitted by staff and to approve the Feather River Hospital tree felling permit application (TP-06-05-29), authorizing the felling of up to 272 qualifying trees to accommodate a proposed hospital facilities expansion and improvement project on property located at 5974 Pentz Road (APNs 053-390-002, 003, 004, 005, 006 and 008), subject to the amended conditions listed below:

Committee Member Britton asked that proposed condition No. 4 be amended to reflect that “each tree or group of trees” have temporary fencing to help preserve the roots during construction. Committee Member Rea withdrew his second, Chairman McGreehan added the correction to the motion and it was seconded by Committee Member Rea and carried by a majority of the Committee Members.

FINDINGS

- A. The Feather River Hospital tree felling permit application meets the criteria for conditional tree felling permit approval as outlined within PMC Section 8.12.090 because the proposed tree felling activity is necessary to accommodate a hospital facility improvement and expansion project proposed for a land area that is zoned to accommodate such a land use.
- B. The proposed tree felling activity, as conditioned, is consistent with applicable Town zoning regulations regarding commercial timber harvesting.
- C. Find that the proposed tree felling permit activity is associated with a hospital facilities expansion project that has been addressed within a proposed environmental document [i.e. mitigated negative declaration] and further find that the project’s environmental document is certified as complying with the requirements of the California Environmental Quality Act.

CONDITIONS TO BE MET PRIOR TO ISSUANCE OF TREE FELLING PERMIT

- 1. Provide material evidence to the town that the process of reviewing construction plans for compliance with applicable code requirements has been initiated for the Feather River Hospital development project.
- 2. Provide material evidence to the town that a permit authorizing construction of an onsite wastewater disposal system has been issued for the proposed development project.
- 3. The applicant shall modify the tree felling and landscaping project plans to identify and incorporate the retention of on-site tree saplings to serve as “in-lieu” replacement trees to the satisfaction of the Town Planning Director.

GENERAL CONDITIONS

4. All qualifying trees proposed to be retained and shown as such upon the project site plan submitted to the Town of Paradise on June 7, 2006 for Tree Committee consideration shall be incorporated into the required landscaping for the project and shall be protected during construction activities in accordance with Town of Paradise Suggested Practices for Protection of Trees on Commercial, Quasi-Public, and Multi-Family Construction Sites, including the use of temporary protective fencing placed at or beyond the drip line of each tree or group of trees to be retained.
5. To the maximum extent feasible, additional native trees existing on the site shall be incorporated into the required landscaping for the project.
6. All project tree felling activity shall be conducted in accordance with the Town's "Noise Control Regulations" [PMC Chapter 9.18].
7. Tree restocking shall be executed in accordance with the requirements of PMC Section 8.12.120.
8. The landscape plan for the proposed hospital facilities expansion development project shall include provisions for the planting of conifer tree species within landscape areas. All landscape trees shall be a minimum fifteen gallon size and shall be selected and ultimately approved by the Town for inclusion within the landscape plan primarily based upon their ability to provide shade for the project site. Smaller ornamental tree species (i.e. dogwood, crepe myrtle) shall not be considered suitable for purposes of mitigating the loss of native trees on the site. (NOTE: The conifer tree species that are to be incorporated within the project's landscape plan shall comprise, at minimum, 50% of the total trees planted; and a minimum of 75% of all proposed landscape trees shall be native species. In addition, any trees planted as "replacement trees" for purposes of restocking shall be consistent with the suggested restocking species listed within Paradise Municipal Code Section 8.12.120 and the replacement ratio shall be 1:1 as related to the total number of qualifying trees to be felled).
9. This approval action by the Paradise Tree Committee shall only be valid for an initial period of eighteen months.
10. All applicable mitigation measures of the project's certified environmental document pertaining to the issue of tree removal shall be performed by the project applicant.

ROLL CALL VOTE: AYES: Committee Members Negle, Rea, Woodhouse and Chairman McGreehan.
NOES: None. ABSTAIN: Committee Member Britton.

MOTION CARRIES.

It was announced that the decision of the Tree Permit Review Committee can be appealed within ten days of the decision date.

4. **OTHER BUSINESS** – None.

5. **IDENTIFICATION/DISCUSSION OF FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

The Tree Permit Review Committee briefly discussed the lack of progress of the landscaping for the expansion at Cobblestone Pharmacy on Clark Road.

6. **ADJOURNMENT**

The Tree Permit Review Committee concurred to adjourn the meeting at 5:30 p.m.

Chairman Al McGreehan

ATTEST:

Suzanne Whalen, Secretary